



*CITY COUNCIL MEETING
CONDUCTED AS AN ON-LINE ZOOM MEETING
Northampton, MA*

Roll Call

A regular meeting of the City Council was called to order by Council President Gina-Louise Sciarra. At 7:01 p.m. on a roll call the following City Councilors were present:

At-Large Councilor Gina-Louise Sciarra	At-Large Councilor William H. Dwight
Ward 1 Councilor Michael J. Quinlan, Jr.	Ward 5 Councilor Alex Jarrett
Ward 2 Councilor Karen Foster	Ward 6 Councilor Marianne LaBarge
Ward 3 Councilor James B. Nash	Ward 7 Councilor Rachel Maiore
Ward 4 Councilor John Thorpe	

Announcement of Audio/Video Recording

Councilor Sciarra announced that the meeting was being held via remote participation and audio and video recorded.

PUBLIC COMMENT

PUBLIC COMMENT

Ace Tayloe of Fruit Street, (they/them), speaking on behalf of the Northampton Housing Partnership, said the partnership would like to speak in support of the ordinance to create an incentive for smaller houses by allowing two half-scale houses to count as one single-family house for density purposes.

Public Hearings Announcement of Public Hearing on 20.173 National Grid Petition for Installation of Underground Conduit on Hockanum Road

Public Hearings

Announcement of Public Hearing on 20.173 National Grid Petition for Installation of Underground Conduit on Hockanum Road

Councilor Sciarra read the following announcement: Per M.G.L. Ch. 166, Section 22, the Northampton City Council will hold a public hearing on **Thursday, February 18, 2021 at 7:15 p.m.** on the petition of National Grid to install underground conduit and associated fixtures on Hockanum Road (Petition# 16315676). Instructions for accessing the hearing may be found on the February 18, 2021 City Council agenda to be posted on the city website (www.northamptonma.gov) at least 48 hours prior to the meeting. The City Council will hear all persons who wish to be heard thereon.

Announcement of Public Hearing on 21.188 Application for License to Store Flammables and Combustibles at 138 North King Street

Announcement of Public Hearing on 21.188 Application for License to Store Flammables and Combustibles at 138 North King Street

Councilor Sciarra read the following announcement: In accordance with M.G.L. Chapter 148, Section 13, Big Y Foods, Inc. has submitted an application for a License for Storage of Flammables and Combustibles for two (2) 20,000-gallon underground fuel storage tanks: one (1) 20,000-gallon gasoline and one (1) 20,000-gallon split tank (10K gasoline/10Kdiesel) within the existing Big Y Supermarket parking lot at 138 North King Street. The City Council will hold a public hearing by remote participation on **Thursday, February 18, 2021 at 7:05 p.m.** Instructions for accessing the hearing may be found on the February 18, 2021 City Council agenda to be posted on the city website (www.northamptonma.gov) at least 48 hours prior to the meeting. The City Council will hear all persons who wish to be heard thereon. The City Council meeting begins at 7 p.m.

Public hearing on package of National Grid/Verizon Pole Petitions to install, relocate and/or remove a total of 37 utility poles on Damon Road and four (4) utility poles on Bridge

Public hearing on package of National Grid/Verizon Pole Petitions to install, relocate and/or remove a total of 37 utility poles on Damon Road and four (4) utility poles on Bridge Road in connection with the MassDOT Damon Road reconstruction project

Councilor Sciarra read the legal notice.

Councilor Dwight moved to open the public hearing. Councilor LaBarge seconded. The motion passed unanimously 9:0 by roll call vote. The public hearing was opened at 7:10 p.m.

Councilor Sciarra read memos (two) from Dawn Nims, Department of Public Works (DPW) Staff Civil Engineer, dated January 14, 2021 regarding petitions for joint and single-ownership pole installations, relocations and removals on Damon Road and Bridge Road.

<p><u>Road in connection with the MassDOT Damon Road reconstruction project</u></p>	<p>Lisa Jasinski and Dan Lopez were present on behalf of National Grid.</p> <p>The only utility pole in question was P7-25, which was closer to a fire hydrant than allowed, Mr. Lopez said. He offered to forward this information to MassDOT. [Due to audio problems, Mr. Lopez's voice was intermittently inaudible.]</p> <p>She will follow up to make sure the correct people are notified that the pole needs to be moved to provide the correct amount of clearance from the fire hydrant, Ms. Jasinski added. The relocation of the poles has to do with the road widening project for Damon Road, she confirmed. She asked Mr. Lopez if he has heard from any abutters with complaints or concerns about the proposed work.</p> <p>No, he said.</p> <p>Councilor Sciarra asked if any proponents wished to speak. Hearing none, she offered the opportunity to speak to opponents. No one spoke.</p> <p>Mrs. Krutzler confirmed she sent out 35 postcards to abutters of the project.</p> <p>Councilor Dwight expressed his understanding that since the work is associated with the widening of Damon Road, the poles will be set back deeper in the abutting properties.</p> <p>The main line of poles runs on the south side of Damon Road so the people on the south side will be most affected, Ms. Jasinski advised. The ones on the north side already sit fairly close to the road as it is.</p> <p>He knows part of the project is creation of a sidewalk system, Councilor Dwight continued. He said he assumed National Grid is in contact and collaborating with design consultants so they don't end up with a pole in the middle of a sidewalk.</p> <p>Ms. Jasinski said this would usually be discussed with the contractor (in this case, MassDOT) in the course of a site visit. She asked Mr. Lopez if he could confirm that the relocations wouldn't interfere with any sidewalks.</p> <p>The pole locations were discussed thoroughly, and no poles should interfere with any sidewalks, Mr. Lopez confirmed.</p> <p>Councilor Quinlan expressed his understanding that the council is being asked to approve the petition but that the DPW director has asked for updated information. He asked whether this request needed to be satisfied prior to the council's approval.</p> <p>DPW Director Donna LaScaleia, who was present for another agenda item, informed councilors that before utility poles can be installed, which is considered an alteration of the public way, a trench permit must be issued by the DPW. In this case, she is holding the trench permits for this project pending the City Council's approval of the petitions tonight. Prior to releasing those trench permits, she will follow up with National Grid to close the loop on any outstanding items.</p> <p>There being no further comments, upon motion made by Councilor Dwight and seconded by Councilor LaBarge, the public hearing was closed at 7:23 p.m. The motion passed unanimously 9:0 by roll call vote.</p> <p>Councilor Dwight moved approval of the pole petitions as a package with the terms and conditions as recommended by the DPW. Councilor Quinlan seconded. The motion passed unanimously 9:0 by roll call vote.</p> <p>Ms. Jasinski asked that copies of the DPW memos be forwarded to her.</p>
---	--

<p><u>I Updates from Council President/ Committee Chairs</u></p>	<p><u>Updates from Council President and Committee Chairs</u></p> <p>There will be a joint meeting of the Planning Board and Legislative Matters on the 25th to discuss the two-family housing ordinances that will be returning to this body, Councilor Dwight announced. [Mrs. Krutzler corrected that the meeting date is actually Monday, February 8th.]</p>
--	--

<p><u>Recognitions and One-Minute Announcements by Councilors</u></p>	<p><u>Recognitions and One-Minute Announcements by Councilors</u></p> <p>The Northampton Policing Review Commission (NPRC) has a big week coming up, Councilor Quinlan related. The Policing Policies and Practices subcommittee is meeting Monday, February 8th and will be joined by Police Chief Jody Kasper for a question and answer period. On Wednesday, the Alternatives to Policing subcommittee will also be joined by Chief Kasper. Thursday, February 9th, the full commission will hold the second of three public hearings beginning at 6 p.m.</p> <p>The date of the public hearing is Thursday, February 11th, Councilor Jarrett corrected.</p> <p>Dr. Joanne Levin of the Cooley Dickinson Hospital (CDH) has emailed the council to say there are openings for adults 70+ for vaccine appointments tomorrow if they sign up tonight through the department of health website, Councilor Foster shared.</p>
<p><u>Communications and Proclamations from the Mayor</u></p>	<p><u>Communications and Proclamations from the Mayor</u></p> <p>At the request of Councilor Jarrett and in light of a resolution the council is taking up later in the meeting, Mayor Narkewicz updated councilors on the city's progress on exploring the feasibility of municipal broadband. As councilors probably know, the city did its first study of this issue in the summer of 2016. City officials hired an outside consultant, Percipio Industries, LLC to take a look at the city's fiber network and the possibility of expanding it into a municipal broadband network. That was a cursory, introductory study and one of its recommendations was to pursue a broader marketing feasibility study. As part of the Capital Improvement Program (CIP) for FY2020-2024, the City Council ultimately approved two appropriations totaling \$70,000 to fund a marketing analysis along with a feasibility study. He put together an ad hoc advisory committee to help develop an RFP, evaluate proposals and conduct interviews comprised of Chief Information Officer (CIO) Antonio Pagan, Chief of Staff Alan Wolf, Councilor Bill Dwight, Executive Director of Northampton Open Media (NOM) Al Williams and members of the Northampton Community Network, an advocacy group for municipal broadband composed of Mark Hamill, Carl Townsend, Lee Feldscher and Pennington Geis.</p> <p>With their input they were able to develop an RFP for this two-phase study that was ultimately issued. The city received bids from multiple companies. A smaller subset of the committee (a group of four) conducted interviews with vendors. Ultimately in early October, the entire advisory committee unanimously recommended that the city select a company called Design Nine to perform the study. He accepted that recommendation and began putting together a contract, and the contract was executed in October.</p> <p>Design Nine has been working on the first piece, which is the marketing analysis. This consists of going out to the public and consumer base and getting an idea of how much interest there would be in the community to buy into and support a local network. Design Nine has been working on a survey to accomplish that, and the goal is to launch it in the coming weeks. They are also working on a paper survey to be mailed to folks as they are conscious of the digital divide and the fact that some may not have access to the internet. This will hopefully give them some of the feedback they need in terms of the market feasibility.</p> <p>The 2nd phase, depending on the results of the first, would be the nuts and bolts of how to construct a network. That is a much more technical analysis looking at the current layout of the city and where there is existing fiber. This would include information about the cost and capital investment needed as well as potential models for how a system could operate. They are well on their way; it's been launched and they hope to have the public outreach for this happening very soon. He will let councilors know so they can put the survey out to constituents to get as much public participation as possible. Design Nine has done this for many other municipalities so they do bring that experience.</p> <p>They are more local than the other candidates and are smaller, giving them adaptability and pliability that wouldn't necessarily exist in a larger corporation more experienced in analyzing larger urban systems, Councilor Dwight shared. Design Nine had a responsiveness and understanding of the size and type of New England community that's facing some unique challenges that other businesses would just be getting up to speed with. Design Nine was the</p>

clear winner. He is pretty confident about and looking forward to their final report.

In June of 2020 (FY2020), the City Council took the first of two required votes on establishing a municipal light plant. He will likely bring a similar vote forward this June with information from the study. He is trying to keep things on track and keep their options open.

The marketing study will be very interesting. This is something they heard loud and clear from Westfield which, even though it has a fully-operating gas and electric utility and control of the utility poles, still needed to be clear for the type of investment necessary that there actually was a market for municipal broadband. They actually used the marketing analysis to decide where to pilot broadband in the city, using neighborhoods that responded most favorably as 'fiberhoods' for pilot purposes. Northampton is very different because it does not have a municipal electric company. Because the infrastructure does not exist their model will be very different from ones discussed in Holyoke, Chicopee and Westfield where they already have public utilities.

They will try to mail the survey to all residents, he confirmed. Director Pagan has been in contact with the City Clerk about the possibility of including it in the census, and she is slated to discuss this with the Board of Registrars

In response to a question from Councilor LaBarge, Mayor Narkewicz said Design Nine's corporate headquarters are in Blackbird, Virginia. They have principals based in New England.

Resolutions
21.193 Resolution
Opposing Internet
Data Caps and
Committing to
Achieving Just
Internet Access
and Affordability -
1st reading

Resolutions
21.193 A Resolution Opposing Internet Data Caps and Committing to Achieving Just
Internet Access and Affordability - 1st reading

Councilor Sciarra read the resolution.

Councilor Dwight moved to approve the resolution in first reading. Councilor Thorpe seconded.

She would like to say they are really happy to join their neighboring partners in Holyoke, Springfield, West Springfield and Agawam in bringing forth resolutions in their communities to stand up to Comcast's plans to impose data caps on northeast customers, Councilor Sciarra volunteered. Initially, as it says in the resolution, the caps were to start now with penalties beginning in March, but now, in response to communities standing up, including its home state of Pennsylvania, whose Attorney General has said this is not right, Comcast has now said that they will postpone these data caps until the summer. They have not said they are not going to impose them, they are just giving a little bit more time.

The fees are \$10 for an additional 50 gigs with a cap of \$100 per month.

As the resolution says, these caps have nothing to do with helping spread usage or solve any problems of an overburdened system, they are purely for profit and to drive consumers to more expensive plans, Councilor Sciarra continued. It is safe to say that it is outrageous to try to squeeze consumers for anything more at a time when robust home access is a necessity for school, work, telehealth, community engagement, attending local government meetings, staying in touch with families and friends and all the things they are not able to do in person.

As they hopefully move past this pandemic, how they do many things has changed and will remain changed. Reliable and safe internet access is a necessary utility. It will be a necessity as it has been for a while but even more than ever. The idea that Comcast is going to give them a little more time but still impose these caps does not feel like any largesse on their part. She thinks they all need to stand up and say this is an unconscionable thing to do.

She thanked her co-sponsors, Councilor Dwight and Councilor Nash. As Mayor Narkewicz said before, Councilor Dwight has been working on the issue of municipal broadband for many, many years. She thanked Amy Tolson of Ward 3 for bringing this to her attention and Councilor Rebecca Lisi of Holyoke for her work and for enthusiastically embracing a collaborative and mutual-interest, cross-community approach. She thinks it's very important to work together here in Western Massachusetts, so she hopes her colleagues on the council will join them in supporting this.

Councilor Dwight said 'Amen.' To be clear, historically Comcast is essentially a federally-sanctioned monopoly. There are no competing interests as far as cable. Comcast will argue that AT & T and Verizon are threatening with 5G service and offer data plans, but Comcast has proprietary ownership of the cables that go to people's houses, "They own the pipeline." Their postponement is not an act of altruism, it is a marketing decision. They realize there's not a lot of good publicity by suddenly imposing more onerous fees during a crisis, but that, on the other hand, by offering little morsels every now and then as circumstances require they can maintain their customer base. They are by charter a commercial enterprise, so their charter requires them to achieve maximum profit for their shareholders. It is not to serve the community. "We are the consumers, we are the source of that revenue for them." Every one of their actions is dictated by that simple goal, to achieve as much profit as possible.

Internet access has transitioned to a very critical utility over the last several decades, similar to when electricity came into being. Industrial-based cities like Holyoke, Westfield, Chicopee, etc. considered electricity so critical to their survival and sustainability they made it a municipally-managed and controlled utility even to the point of creating hydro-electric dams and other sources of energy. This is no different in that respect. There will come a time for a larger conversation about whether it is necessary to have internet access be a municipal service that provides more equity and considers people less able to accommodate the associated cost. This has all been brought into very sharp and clear focus by COVID. They are conducting this meeting because internet exists; they wouldn't have been able to do this five years ago. Their consumption of internet is increasing exponentially. Comcast realizes its revenue is now through data and that, if it controls the system by which data is consumed, demand will continue to increase.

The letter from Comcast (Councilor Dwight referred to a letter from Eileen B. Leahy, Senior Manager of Comcast Government and Regulatory Affairs to the Northampton City Council dated February 3, 2021) talks about what they describe as typical consumption, but it's not true, he contested. If you are a single mother and you have three children in three different levels of school, you are suddenly now streaming three systems of education for your children and that amplifies your consumption three times. Right now, if you're downloading movies on your TV, 4K is the peak and 8K is the goal and coming, with 8K, "you're hitting a terabyte of information in a heartbeat." The trend is not that we'll be consuming less; we will be consuming more, it is a given. "We will continue to be beholden to Comcast," which enjoys the protection of not having competition. With that in mind, it is imperative to send a message and it's heartening to see they did send a message to some degree. Something compelled Comcast to respond with a message to them. He'd even welcome the debate.

Healthcare, government, "every dimension of our lives that we tend to take for granted is directly channeled and piped through Comcast's system," he observed. That makes him a little uncomfortable. He is grateful to fellow sponsors and to councilors and Councilor Lisi in Holyoke who voted 7-4 to approve this, a surprisingly close vote.

It is a fight that doesn't end today; it hopefully starts today, he concluded.

This resolution and the other resolutions that are being endorsed in other cities are already being successful, Councilor Nash agreed. When they first started drafting this earlier in the week, the rollout for this was going to be this spring and it's already being pushed back to the end of June, so there's a measure of success. He thanked Chief Information Officer Antonio Pagan for spending a few minutes boiling things down for him in easy to digest ways. He has kept IT up and running for a few years and his rule of thumb is that their data needs will double every two years. It is very difficult to stop that growth. Consumers can buy a new TV or phone if it breaks, but the fact is that all the technology they buy to replace what they have is working at a much higher capacity for data. He didn't realize there is actually 4K. Newer TV's are going to be four times what many people currently use right now. "If you eat up 150 units of data, within a month, multiply that times four and you are starting to approach [the cap]."

He talked to Director Pagan about the basic needs of both employees, students and families with children within Northampton. By and large, he said, city employees are doing fine, they wouldn't be impacted by this because of the type of data shared between departments. But families with parents working and children learning at home have multiple devices all in use at the same time and those are also draining data. Computers, laptops and phones are obviously using data, but each time consumers buy a device, be it a refrigerator, new furnace, security

system or doorbell, everything is now logging onto the internet and using data as well. The ceiling of 1.2 terabytes is something they are quickly approaching. 5% are there but the rest of them are very quickly growing into that. He thanked his cosponsors and asked the rest of his colleagues to support the resolution. "Let's join other communities in taking this stand," he urged.

Councilor Jarrett thanked the three sponsors for introducing the resolution, saying it's something he's very happy to support. Comcast has an 'Internet Essentials' service but it's only available to people who qualify as lower-income and people who haven't had service with Comcast in the last three months, so lower-income households who have been paying for regular service with Comcast wouldn't be able to lower their bills unless they stopped service for three months. He referred to a House bill, HD663, an emergency bill intended to be in effect until the state of emergency is lifted, which prohibits data caps, price increases, new fees and shut offs during the COVID emergency. It currently has 64 sponsors. He sent the link to the administrative assistant so it could be part of the record. He is wondering if support for that bill could be part of the reading. It seems like it fits in very well with this resolution. Representative Sabadosa is one of the cosponsors.

Councilor Dwight said he for one would accept that as an amendment. It would go nicely with the paragraph that already encourages permanent legislation.

Councilor Dwight proposed another amendment to add Karen Charles Peterson, Commissioner for the Department of Telecommunications (DTC) in Massachusetts, to the list of recipients in the last paragraph.

Members agreed to the following wording of a paragraph to be inserted: BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that, the Northampton City Council supports and endorses emergency House bill HD663 (an act protecting internet access during the COVID-19 pandemic).

Councilor Jarrett moved to amend the resolution. Councilor Dwight seconded.

Councilor Maiore said she wanted to validate what Councilor Dwight says because this mom of three went over her 1.2 terabyte on the 23rd of this month, she reported.

Councilor Foster thanked Councilor Nash for his helpful explanation regarding being able to expect data use to double every two years.

Councilor LaBarge said she would love to have a Comcast representative come in, and Councilor Sciarra said she would be happy to put someone on an agenda for discussion.

The motion to amend passed unanimously 9:0 by roll call vote.

The motion to approve the resolution as amended in first reading passed 9:0 by roll call vote.

See minutes of February 18, 2021 for second reading.

Consent Agenda

Consent Agenda

Councilor Sciarra reviewed the items on the consent agenda, offering to remove any item for separate discussion upon request. Councilor Quinlan requested the removal of the appointment of Jonathan Daube. **Councilor Dwight moved to approve the consent agenda with the removal. Councilor Quinlan seconded. The motion passed unanimously 9:0 by roll call vote.**

The following items were approved as part of the consent agenda:

- A. Minutes of January 7, 2021 City Council Meeting
- B. 21.187 Appointments to Various Committees – all positive recommendations, City Services Committee – 2/1/2021

Arts Council

Dana Osterling, 58 Paradise Road, Apt. 1, Northampton

Term: February 2021-June 2024

To fill a vacancy

Thulani Davis, 112 Franklin Street, Northampton
 Term: February 2021-June 2024
To fill a vacancy

Historical Commission

Rev. Harvey Hill, 19 Ward Avenue, Northampton
 Term: February 2021-June 2024
To fill a vacancy

Councilor Dwight moved to approve the appointment of Jonathan Daube to the Historical Commission. Councilor Maiore seconded.

Councilor Quinlan said he spoke to the city solicitor about the fact that Dr. Jonathan Daube and his wife Linda contributed to his campaign in 2019. They were in agreement that there was no conflict of interest but Attorney Seewald's advice was that he make a public declaration to the people of Northampton in the interests of transparency. To be clear, this does not disqualify him from voting to approve the appointment.

The motion passed 9:0 by roll call vote. The following appointment was approved:

Historical Commission

Dr. Jonathan Daube, 15 Carolyn Street, Florence
 Term: February 2021- June 2024
To fill a vacancy

<p><u>Recess for Committee on Finance Meeting</u></p>	<p>At 8:20 p.m., the City Council recessed for the Committee on Finance. The Committee on Finance adjourned at 9 p.m. The City Council reconvened at 9 p.m.</p>
--	---

<p><u>Financial Orders (on 1st reading pending Finance)</u> <u>21.191 Order to Acquire Land on Nash Hill Road in Williamsburg for Water Supply Protection-1st rdg</u> <u>21.192 Order to Appropriate Free Cash to City Clerk for Elections and DPW for Asphalt - 1st reading</u></p>	<p><u>Financial Orders (on 1st reading pending Finance review)</u> <u>21.191 An Order to Acquire Land on Nash Hill Road in Williamsburg for Water Supply Protection - 1st reading</u> Councilor LaBarge moved to approve the order in first reading. Councilor Foster seconded. The motion passed unanimously 9:0 by roll call vote. <u>See minutes of February 18, 2021 for second reading.</u> <u>21.192 An Order to Appropriate Free Cash to City Clerk for Elections and DPW for Asphalt - 1st reading</u> Councilor LaBarge moved to approve the order in first reading. Councilor Maiore seconded. The motion passed unanimously 9:0 by roll call vote. <u>See minutes of February 18, 2021 for second reading.</u></p>
---	---

<p><u>Financial Orders (in 2nd reading)</u></p>	<p><u>Financial Orders (in 2nd reading)</u> None</p>
---	---

<p><u>Orders</u> <u>21.190 Order Endorsing the Climate Resilience and Regeneration Plan - 1st reading</u></p>	<p><u>Orders</u> <u>21.190 An Order Endorsing the Climate Resilience and Regeneration Plan - 1st reading</u> Councilor Sciarra read the order. Councilor Dwight moved to approve the order in first reading. Council LaBarge seconded. Office of Planning and Sustainability Director Wayne Feiden gave a Powerpoint presentation, giving special thanks to Councilor Maiore and Councilor Jarrett who sit on the Northampton Energy and Sustainability Commission (NESC) and know as much about the plan as anyone. As councilors know, the city has a comprehensive plan (the Sustainable Northampton Plan) which</p>
--	---

guides a lot of the work his office and other departments do and serves as one criteria for issuing special permits. That plan was adopted in 2008 and has been amended three times. It was amended to add the Pedestrian and Bicycle Plan in 2017, the Open Space, Recreation and Multiuse Trail Plan in 2018 and now to add the Climate Resilience & Regeneration Plan. What's before them is the plan itself.

Under state law, the Planning Board is the board that legally adopts comprehensive plans but it doesn't mean much if it is not accepted by other boards. NESC has adopted the plan.

Resilience is about adaptation, being resilient to chronic and acute stress. In this case, it's about climate-change caused chronic and acute stress. Acute being more hurricanes becoming worse because of climate change and chronic stress being more homeless people getting Lyme disease because it's getting warmer and there is more prevalence of Lyme.

Regeneration includes climate change mitigation such as reducing the city's contribution to carbon emissions.

They deliberately use the words resilience and regeneration because the terms mean more; they're broader. They want to be resilient to anything. COVID is not climate-change caused but they clearly want to be resilient to COVID. Regeneration includes things like removing invasive plants that come in. The goal is not just to survive climate change but to thrive in spite of it.

The next two slides are most important: what the plan is all about. They don't know all the steps they will be doing over the next 10, 20 or 30 years so they're trying to create a road map to get there. They are trying to create a target, a commitment for where the city is going. The Mayor set a target for them two years ago of being carbon neutral by 2050 so they adopted that as an end goal, but it's the intermediate goals that are the bigger challenge. Can they make city buildings and operations net carbon neutral by 2030, hit 50% of the goal by 2030 and 75% of the goal by 2040?

NESC spent a lot of time debating these issues to identify goals that are really aspirational and really going to push them but that they think they can achieve, he observed.

The other part is weaving equity through all these things. Some people are front-line for climate change, meaning they are more impacted by climate change than others.

There is a series of actions involved in getting to the goal. Some things they don't know yet so they always want to come back to basic operating principles. They have been talking a lot about renewable energy, electric cars and electric heating systems, but the first and most important principal is to reduce their energy demand in the first place. If people can walk instead of using a car, that is going to have a much greater impact on climate change than making cars electric. If people have smaller homes or better-insulated homes, that's going to make a greater impact on climate change than switching to electric forms of energy.

We're going to be all challenged going forward, he acknowledged. Planners do a lot of community engagement, and the community has a lot of really great ideas, many of which were used. Sometimes ideas are sexy in the moment, but part of their charge is to always look at the most high-impact practices, the things that give the greatest return on investment. They don't have enough time and money to do all the things they'd like to do, so they have to prioritize and concentrate on the things that give them the most bang for the buck.

Because they can't really plan out a strategy for the next 20 years, they plan to flesh out the plan every two years. Part of this is thinking about what this means in terms of the operating budget and capital budget. The Mayor proposed and the City Council approved money to look at every single city building to plot out a chart for them to become carbon neutral. At midnight when the boiler breaks is not the time to think about how to replace that boiler. For every capital improvement request they need to think about what the impact is on the climate.

In the climate action world, Scope 1 emissions are emissions they're directly responsible for. Scope 2 is their footprint because of their utility generation. Those are the things they are focusing on. For Northampton, they are mostly ignoring Scope 3, which is actually the biggest source of greenhouse gas emissions, indirect emissions from the supply chain. If you buy a pen,

it comes from China and is shipped here by Amazon. They don't actually have much control over this other than educating people to buy less plastic. For the most part they are focused on what happens here, not what gets made elsewhere.

Director Feiden displayed a pie chart showing the source of the city's greenhouse gas emissions from 2016. The two big things are buildings - commercial buildings, which include multi-families, are half the city's greenhouse gas emissions (52%). Residential buildings - single-family homes and two-families - are 18%. Transportation is 26%. If they really want to impact climate change they need an incredible focus on buildings. They are a very slow-growing community, so they talk about new building codes to make new buildings net zero. But the majority of buildings in Northampton already exist so they can't just focus on new buildings, they have to think about existing buildings. Likewise, transportation is a quarter of their load and part of that is electrifying transportation. Part of it is all the work planners and the city council have done on improving public transportation, improving bicycle paths and improving pedestrian accommodations and encouraging density within walking distance of where people want to go to reduce the number of trips in the first place. When he talks about high-impact practices, this is the table he always comes back to. They don't have a lot of livestock in Northampton, he noted, referring to another significant source of emissions. Globally, being vegetarians would have a big effect on climate but in Northampton it really has no effect.

Director Feiden displayed a chart, titled "Northampton High Case GHG Emissions Projection." The scale on the left shows the current amount of greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions. If they do nothing, the red dashed line across the top shows that their GHG emissions would stay the same. Consultants mapped out the big picture items that move them down to 2050 but only projected out to 2030, so the fan-shaped colors on the map are the so-called 'wedge diagram,' big picture things they can do to reduce greenhouse gas emissions. (The associated legend identifies various colors as actions such as Electric Vehicle Deployment, Net Zero Energy New Buildings and Renewable/Low Carbon Electricity.) The chart plots out a diagonal line across the graph as if they were aiming to have a steady reduction in carbon emissions from 2016 to 2050. However, the red line is a more aggressive target they're setting for themselves since they want to be halfway to being carbon neutral by 2030, Feiden explained. They don't have really have great data, but, as of now, they are not on track to meet that goal. Thus, they have to be really aggressive between now and 2030.

Of course, existing buildings are still going to be there so they're stuck with all these 'stranded assets' even if everyone buys new electric cars and builds net zero homes. Northampton has some benefits. Smith College is committed to its building stock - its heating and cooling thermal loads - being carbon neutral by 2030. The fact that Smith College is a leader really helps them be a leader. All of this is to say they need to do more; they have mapped out some of the paths forward but not all the paths forward.

Director Feiden reviewed a slide entitled "Regeneration: High Impact Pathways." These are the big pathways they want to think about, he advised. First on the list is reducing energy demand through conservation and efficiency whenever possible and switching to renewable electricity sources when possible. Land use patterns are pretty far down the list but are probably responsible for 15% of GHG emissions. This is where they might meet resistance; people are all in favor of buying electric cars but they may not be in favor of density in their neighborhood.

It is impossible to meet any of these goals by carbon reductions alone. They are still going to need firetrucks, and backhoes are still going to be gasoline and diesel until at least 2030 and maybe 2040. So they need to think about carbon sequestration. This is obviously about trees but, statewide, soil holds about three times as much carbon as trees do. This is about growing trees, but it's also about putting carbon in the soil and preserving it there. The only way to get to net zero is by saying that, for every ton of GHG emissions, we're putting aside the equivalent in trees and soil.

The mitigation side of this is adapting to climate change. This is where a lot of the city's investment has been, so they've made a lot of progress in this area. In Northampton, the biggest part of dealing with the changing climate is addressing bigger storms. The city is doing everything from installing bigger pipes - such as the \$1.2 million pipes installed on Pleasant Street a couple of years ago - to the wetlands restorations at the Pine Grove golf course: human-built things and natural things.

Warming/heating is probably the next biggest challenge. They're going to have a few hotter peak days but the biggest challenge is the number of days over 90 degrees, which can be killers for people without air-conditioning and with different health issues. Somewhere down the line they may have a change in insect vectors of disease, such as a greater prevalence of Lyme disease because of more ticks.

Director Feiden briefly mentioned big ideas that cut across the plan, such as conservation first and equity and thinking about city operations through a climate lens. As far as renewable energy, the City Council has already authorized entering into a more aggressive Community Choice Aggregation (CCA) program than most communities and the Mayor is moving forward with that.

Today, 20% of their energy is from electricity. As they electrify, that load will go up dramatically. As they reduce their GHG emissions and reduce their use of fossil fuels, they are going to be using a lot more electricity. Northampton is one of the first communities in the commonwealth to authorize the Property-Assessed Clean Energy (PACE) program where people can make improvements to commercial buildings and basically get a surcharge on their property tax.

On the resiliency side, dealing with stormwater is a key part. Waste crosses over between resiliency and regeneration. Solid waste accounts for 1% of the city's GHG emissions, but it is dwarfed in comparison to other sources of GHG. If they also think of solid waste as being an opportunity for source reduction (not just getting rid of all the stuff they generate but reducing the source in the first place) it has a much bigger impact on the mission.

Transportation is 26% of their load, he reiterated. Land use is associated with transportation because a lot of the benefits for land uses such as dense, mixed-use developments are reduced trips. They still believe in free choice; their goal isn't to force people to live anywhere but to allow them to live anywhere. They know when people live in urban areas, the units tend to be smaller. Besides the transportation savings they're also getting smaller buildings.

The final category is broadly health and safety. The Mayor has said one of his top goals for next year is to acquire and open a community resilience hub. Such a place addresses a lot of needs that aren't climate-related, he acknowledged. For example, if they had one, it would be helping a lot with COVID right now. But a lot of the purpose of the resiliency hub is to provide a safe place for people in need because of climate change.

Director Feiden fielded questions and comments from councilors.

Councilor Dwight moved to approve the order endorsing the plan in first reading. Councilor Jarrett seconded.

Councilor Dwight thanked Director Feiden, saying he knew and appreciated the work and challenges associated with development of the plan. As a former member of the energy and sustainability committee, he thought they were going to be voting on it almost two years ago but appreciated the fact that planners walked it back and allowed for even more discussion, contribution and development. He looks at what has been laid out as a map or an atlas of sort. As they grapple with the enormous issue of planetary impact and climate change, they have laid out very well the challenges they realistically are facing.

He points out quite rightly that the existing building inventory will continue to be a drain and to contribute to the crisis they are trying to avert. They can't require everyone to retrofit their homes in order to meet the plan's aspirational goals. He is grateful for the realistic perspective and dimension while at the same time maintaining a commitment to the aspiration. He is especially grateful for the contributions and enthusiastic debate.

The plan affects most debates going forward. It affects how they address COVID and land use regulations and has informed the plastics reduction debate and discussion of how they're going to deal with their waste stream. Every conversation they have, every decision they make, this should be embedded in it as a priority for discussion. As an aside, someone made a crack about 'green-washing' in the conversation about defunding the police because they were interested in the purchase of electric vehicles for the police department. He wants the community to

understand it is not 'green-washing' in any sense, it is devotion to this principal. One of the principal drivers was equity and justice and fairness and how critically these things are all part of that same warp and weave. He is enormously grateful. He takes some hope in this because the city's previous visioning plans have served them very well. The Vision 2020 plan really has informed how they have legislated up to 2021. It is not 'greenwashing,' it is a moral commitment they are making and are going to adhere to.

Councilor Jarrett thanked Director Feiden and current and former members of NESC. As a member of that commission, he is really glad they took the extra year to revise the plan. He thinks it is much stronger; they have had input from great groups like Climate Action Now and Sunrise Northampton. He recognizes the plan isn't good enough to do what they need to do, which is to address their part in the climate emergency by being carbon neutral by 2030. As Director Feiden talked about, there are many things city government just doesn't have control over and for which they need state and federal action. But he does encourage them to think about how they can push the boundaries even if it makes themselves and their constituents uncomfortable. He thinks that's absolutely necessary.

Councilor Foster said she appreciated the presentation. She heard some feedback a year or so ago that the plan needed to be stronger so she also appreciates the extra year. There are a lot of climate activists in Ward 2 and it is an issue a lot of her constituents care deeply about. She spent a long time on the phone yesterday with somebody who asked what he can do to help the city work toward these goals. She wanted to throw the ball out there that there are people in Northampton who want to be a part of the solution and would like to be helpful in that. As this work progresses and as opportunities arise, let us help our constituents move this forward because it is something people want to be a part of, she urged.

Councilor Sciarra thanked everyone who put in the work to create this living document. She called the motion to a vote, and it passed unanimously 9:0 by roll call vote.

See minutes of February 18, 2021 for second reading.

<p><u>Ordinances (Not Yet Referred)</u> <u>21.189 Ordinance to Create an Incentive for Smaller Houses by Allowing Two Half-Scale Units to Count as a Single-Family for Density Purposes</u></p>	<p><u>Ordinances (Not Yet Referred)</u> <u>21.189 An Ordinance to Create an Incentive for Smaller Houses by Allowing Two Half-Scale Units to Count as a Single-Family for Density Purposes</u> Councilor Dwight moved to refer the ordinance to the Planning Board and Legislative Matters for a joint hearing to discuss these items. Councilor Maiore seconded. Councilor Jarrett asked to amend the motion to also refer the ordinance to the Community Resources Committee. Councilor Dwight and Councilor Maiore accepted this as a friendly amendment. The motion passed unanimously 9:0 by roll call vote.</p>
<p><u>Ordinances</u></p>	<p><u>Ordinances</u> None.</p>
<p><u>New Business</u></p>	<p><u>New Business</u> None</p>
<p><u>Information (Charter Provision 2-7) & Study Requests</u></p>	<p><u>Information (Charter Provision 2-7) and Information Study Requests</u> None</p>
<p><u>Motion to Adjourn</u></p>	<p>Upon motion made by Councilor Dwight and seconded by Councilor Foster, the meeting was adjourned at 9:41 p.m. The motion carried unanimously 9:0 by roll call vote.</p>

Attest: _____ Administrative Assistant to the City Council

EXHIBIT A

List of Documents Reviewed at February 4, 2021 Northampton City Council Meeting:

1. February 4, 2021 Agenda
2. City Council Meeting Minutes of January 7, 2021
3. Letter from Eileen B. Leahy, Senior Manager of Comcast Government and Regulatory Affairs, dated February 3, 2021 re: Resolution Opposing Internet Data Caps and Committing to Achieving Just Internet Access and Affordability.
4. Memo from Greg Newman, Senior Engineer, Department of Public Works to Donna Lascaleia, Department of Public Works Director dated January 27, 2021 re: 20.173 National Grid Petition (#16315676) – Underground Wire & Conduit in Hockanum Road
5. 20.173 National Grid Petition for Installation of Underground Conduit on Hockanum Road (Petition#16315676)
6. 21.188 Application for License to Store Flammables and Combustibles at 138 North King Street
7. Memo from Dawn Nims, Staff Civil Engineer to Donna Lascaleia, DPW Director dated January 14, 2021 re: Council Orders 20.174 & 20.177 – Petition for Joint or Identical and Single Ownership Pole Relocations No. 23303524 – Damon Road Reconstruction Project MassDOT No. 608236 – Bridge road
8. Memo from Dawn Nims, Staff Civil Engineer to Donna Lascaleia, DPW Director dated January 14, 2021 re: Council Orders 20.175 & 20.176 – Petition for Joint or Identical and Single Ownership Pole Relocations No. 23303524 – Damon Road Reconstruction Project MassDOT No. 608236 – Damon road
9. 20.174 National Grid Pole Petition for Bridge Road
10. 20.175 National Grid Pole Petition for Damon Road
11. 20.176 National Grid-Verizon Pole Petition for Damon Road
12. 20.177 National Grid-Verizon Pole Petition for Bridge Road
13. 21.193 A Resolution Opposing Internet Data Caps and Committing to Achieving Just Internet Access and Affordability
14. 21.187 Appointments to Various Committees – Memo from Mayor David J. Narkewicz to City Council dated January 14, 2020 re: Appointments to Boards, Committees, and Commissions proposing the appointment of Dana Osterling and Thulani Davis to the Arts Council, and Dr. Jonathan Daube and Rev. Harvey Hill to the Historical Commission
15. 21.191 An Order to Acquire Land on Nash Hill Road in Williamsburg for Water Supply Protection
16. Plan entitled “Ryan Reservoir & West Whately Reservoir Watersheds, Proposed Land Acquisition, Przasnyski Parcel, February 2021, Prepared by: City of Northampton, Department of Public Works, Engineering Division”
17. Plan entitled “Plan of land in Williamsburg, Massachusetts Prepared for Northampton Dept. of Public Works” by Holmberg & Howe Land Surveyors, dated December 16, 2020
18. Plan entitled “Ryan Reservoir & West Whately Reservoir Watersheds, Proposed Land Acquisition, Przasnyski Parcel, February 2021, Prepared by: City of Northampton, Department of Public Works, Engineering Division” Watershed zones
19. 21.192 An Order to Appropriate Free Cash to City Clerk for Elections and DPW for Asphalt
20. 21.190 An Order Endorsing the Climate Resilience and Regeneration Plan
21. Northampton Climate Resilience and Regeneration Plan
22. 21.189 An Ordinance to Create an Incentive for Smaller Houses by Allowing Two Half-Scale Units to Count as a Single-Family for Density Purposes

Record of City Council Votes for February 4, 2021		Dwight	Foster	Jarrett	LaBarge	Maio	Nash	Quinlan	Sciarra	Thorpe	Total	
Roll Call by Laura Krutzler, Administrative Assistant to the City Council @ 7:01 p.m.		Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	9 present	
Open public hearing on package of National Grid/Verizon Pole Petitions		Motion to open	Yes	Yes	Second Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Motion carried 9:0;	
Close public hearing on package of National Grid/Verizon Pole Petitions		Motion to close	Yes	Yes	Second Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Motion carried 9:0;	
Motion to Approve the Package of Four (4) National Grid/Verizon Pole Petitions with Petition #23303524 for Damon Road and Bridge Road with the conditions as recommended by the DPW.		Motion to approve Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Second Yes	Yes	Yes	Motion carried 9:0; roll call	
21.193 A Resolution Opposing Internet Data Caps and Committing to Achieving Just Internet Access and Affordability - 1st reading		1st reading Motion to approve Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Second Yes	Motion carried 9:0; roll call	
Amendment that Inserts a Paragraph Showing The City Council's Support of Emergency House Bill HD663		Second Yes	Yes	Motion to amend Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Motion carried 9:0; roll call	
Approval of Consent Agenda		Motion to approve Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Second Yes	Yes	Yes	Motion carried 9:0; roll call	
RECESS FOR FINANCE COMMITTEE												
Approval of Minutes of January 7, 2021						Second Yes			Motion to approve Yes	Yes	Yes	Motion carried 4:0; roll call
21.191 An Order to Acquire Land on Nash Hill Road in Williamsburg for Water Supply Protection						Second Yes			Motion to positively recommend Yes	Yes	Yes	Motion carried 4:0; roll call
21.192 An Order to Appropriate Free Cash to City Clerk for Elections and DPW for Asphalt						Motion to positively recommend Yes			Yes	Yes	Second Yes	Motion carried 4:0; roll call
ADJOURN FINANCE						Second Yes			Motion to adjourn Yes	Yes	Yes	Motion carried 4:0; roll call
RESUME CITY COUNCIL MEETING												
21.191 An Order to Acquire Land on Nash Hill Road in Williamsburg for Water Supply Protection - 1st reading		1st reading	Yes	Second Yes	Yes	Motion to approve Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Motion carried 9:0; roll call
21.192 An Order to Appropriate Free Cash to City Clerk for Elections and DPW for Asphalt - 1st reading		1st reading	Yes	Yes	Yes	Motion to approve Yes	Second yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Motion carried 9:0; roll call
21.190 An Order Endorsing the Climate Resilience and Regeneration Plan - 1st reading		1st reading	Motion to approve Yes	Yes	Yes	Second Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Motion carried 9:0; roll call

Record of City Council Votes for February 4, 2021		Dwight	Foster	Jarrett	LaBarge	Maioire	Nash	Quinlan	Sciarra	Thorpe	Total
21.189 An Ordinance to Create an Incentive for Smaller Houses by Allowing Two Half-Scale Units to Count as a Single-Family for Density Purposes	Refer	Motion to refer Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Second yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Motion carried 9:0; roll call
Motion to Adjourn		Motion to adjourn Yes	Second Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Motion carried 9:0; roll call

At 9:41 p.m., Councilor Dwight moved to adjourn the meeting; Councilor Foster seconded the motion. The motion was approved on a voice vote of 9 Yes, 0 No